

Freedom of Information requests

2013

Reference number: 13-012

Many thanks for your response to my Fol request of June 11th, 2013

CATERING CONTRACT

I would be grateful if you could supply me with some further information and relevant documents relating to the awarding of the catering contract to Elior UK.

From my perusal of the ITT document it does not appear that the issue of Welsh produce is mentioned in that initial document. At what point in the tender process was the question of use of Welsh produce raised?

Following their successful tender was the company then asked to commit to ensuring Welsh produce was provided as part of the contract award?

Did that lead to the final contract price being renegotiated? If it was, what was the final contract price compared to the tender?

If Elior was asked to provide Welsh produce, and that led to a higher final contract price, were the other unsuccessful tenderers also given the opportunity to resubmit revised tenders based on an element of Welsh produce?

If the final contract price was revised, did the National Museum of Wales take into account EU procurement rules in relation to the awarding of the contract? If so, what did it do?

I note the supply of some of the scoring sheets – can you please supply any further scoring sheets not originally supplied and any other relevant documents (not already supplied) in relation to the awarding of the catering contract?

I note from Appendix 6 that the minimum requirement of between 22% and 24% of Welsh food and beverages. How was that figure arrived at? You may be aware that 41% of the Welsh Government's All Wales Catering Contract in 2011-12 were products produced or grown in Wales.

ASBESTOS

In reference to the works in the Mineral Collection at the National Museum can you explain why this project was not carried out in one tender? Can you tell me what at present is the total contingency budget for asbestos removal?

Reference no.: 13-012

7 August 2013

Dear,

REQUEST FOR INFORMATION – *Information related to the awarding of the catering contract to Elior UK.*

Thank you for your request for information. As Head of Knowledge & Information Management for Amgueddfa Cymru - National Museum Wales, I am responsible for responding to your request for information.

I refer to your email of 10th July 2013 which you asked for the following information:

- 1 *From my perusal of the ITT document it does not appear that the issue of Welsh produce is mentioned in that initial document. At what point in the tender process was the question of use of Welsh produce raised?*
- 2 *Following their successful tender was the company then asked to commit to ensuring Welsh produce was provided as part of the contract award?*
- 3 *Did that lead to the final contract price being renegotiated? If it was, what was the final contract price compared to the tender?*
- 4 *If Elior was asked to provide Welsh produce, and that led to a higher final contract price, were the other unsuccessful tenderers also given the opportunity to resubmit revised tenders based on an element of Welsh produce?*
- 5 *If the final contract price was revised, did the National Museum of Wales take into account EU procurement rules in relation to the awarding of the contract? If so, what did it do?*

6 *I note the supply of some of if the scoring sheets – can you please supply any further scoring sheets not originally supplied and any other relevant documents (not already supplied) in relation to the awarding of the catering contract?*

7 *I note from Appendix 6 that the minimum requirement of between 22% and 24% of Welsh food and beverages. How was that figure arrived at? You may be aware that 41% of the Welsh Government's All Wales Catering Contract 2011 - 12 were products produced or grown in Wales.*

8 *In reference to the works in the Mineral collection at the National Museum can you explain why this project was not carried out in one tender? Can you tell me what at present the total contingency budget for asbestos removal?*

Response

In responding to your request for information, I will be referring some of your questions individually while others will be grouped and answered collectively.

The following information was considered under the Freedom of Information Act 2000.

1/ *From my perusal of the ITT document it does not appear that the issue of Welsh produce is mentioned in that initial document. At what point in the tender process was the question of use of Welsh produce raised?*

As you would expect from a public sector organisation with a unique place in Welsh life, the use of Welsh produce is very important to us and that was reflected in our criteria in the ITT. This led to all of the short-listed bidders addressing it. As a public body we had to balance our desire for Welsh produce against our needs to obtain best value and to appoint a partner with the skills and expertise to operate successful catering concessions at three of major our sites, so we didn't think it was necessary to specify the level of Welsh produce to be supplied. We instead required the bidders to put forward their proposals. The bidders who demonstrated good proposals scored well against the criteria and, in relation to the sourcing of Welsh products, scored well against interview criterion 3 in particular.

- 2/ *Following their successful tender was the company then asked to commit to ensuring Welsh produce was provided as part of the contract award?*
- 3/ *Did that lead to the final contract price being renegotiated? If it was, what was the final contract price compared to the tender?*
- 4/ *If Elior was asked to provide Welsh produce, and that led to a higher final contract price, were the other unsuccessful tenderers also given the opportunity to resubmit revised tenders based on an element of Welsh produce?*

The successful company had already put forward general proposals for using produce from Welsh sources in its tender response and this was further explored during the interview stage. We asked the company to commit to a minimum level of Welsh produce and the use of Welsh distributors to back up its general proposals, as we would have required any of the other bidders to do, had they been successful.

As regards the “final contract price”, there isn’t a “contract price” as such. The contract is a concession so the company provides catering services to the public from our sites and pays us a rent based on the company’s sales revenue. As a result of the adjustment to the Welsh produce and supplier proposals and the fixing of minimum requirements, the total rent detailed in Appendix 2 of our previous FOI response (9 July 2013) was reduced from £4,546,072 to £4,320,836.

As we stated in the ITT and in our original advert, we expected there to be negotiations with the successful tenderer and adjustments to the successful proposal. However, even factoring in the above adjustment to the total rent, the successful company’s offer was still the best value offer by a considerable margin and the company also best met our overall requirements in the ITT. As such, it would have been inappropriate for us to require the other bidders to do anything further.

- 5/ *If the final contract price was revised, did the National Museum of Wales take into account EU procurement rules in relation to the awarding of the contract? If so, what did it do?*

As a public body, we are required to consider the EU procurement rules when awarding public contracts. However, concessions like this one fall outside the EU procurement rules so public bodies have the flexibility to decide what advertising and process to use to achieve their objectives. However, in the interests of transparency and achieving our requirements we advertised the opportunity and followed the process in the ITT.

- 6/ *I note the supply of some of if the scoring sheets – can you please supply any further scoring sheets not originally supplied and any other relevant documents (not already supplied) in relation to the awarding of the catering contract?*

Relating to scoring, Appendix 1 to this response sets out some additional notes taken during the interviews that we have been able to find from our further trawl through our records.

With regard to documents relating to the awarding of the catering contract, Appendix 2 sets out the letters sent to the unsuccessful bidders informing them of the results of the process.

- 7/ *I note from Appendix 6 that the minimum requirement of between 22% and 24% of Welsh food and beverages. How was that figure arrived at? You may be aware that 41% of the Welsh Government's All Wales Catering Contract 2011 -12 were products produced or grown in Wales.*

As mentioned above, the figures were agreed following discussions with the company in the light of its general proposals for Welsh produce in its tender response.

8/ *In reference to the works in the Mineral collection at the National Museum can you explain why this project was not carried out in one tender? Can you tell me what at present the total contingency budget for asbestos removal?*

Under the Freedom of Information Act 2000, the information you have requested is exempt from disclosure as the information relates to environmental data (section 30 – Environmental Information) and will now be considered under the Environmental Information Regulations 2004 (EIRs).

I have considered your first request in accordance with the EIRs, as the information you have requested, in my view, falls within the definition of “environmental information” as stated under the Regulation.

Response

Amgueddfa Cymru appointed a contractor to undertake the required work but as they progressed it became apparent that they were unable to fulfil the requirements within the contract sum as the work was taking much longer than expected. The Museum concluded that rather than extend the contract it was more appropriate to define the remaining work and incorporate this into a new tender process, which will now be progressed over the summer. The funding for this work was initially from the contingency budget, this budget varies throughout the year depending on the level of any underspend in other budgets, however the ability of the Museum to complete these works isn't dependent upon the level of contingency funding as this work is important and will if required be funded from the museum's reserves.

Appeal Procedure for EIR requests

If you are not satisfied with the handling of your request, you have the right to ask for an internal review. Under Regulation 11(2) of the EIRs, a request for an internal review should be submitted no later than 40 working days after the date of this letter and should be addressed to the Director of Collections and Research at the following address:

Mr John Williams-Davies
Director of Collections and Research
Amgueddfa Cymru – National Museum Wales
Cathays Park
Cardiff
CF10 3NP

If you do request an internal review and are not content with its outcome, you have the right to apply directly to the Information Commissioner's Office at:

Information Commissioner's Office – Wales
2nd Floor
Churchill House
Churchill Way
Cardiff
CF10 2HH

Appeal procedure for FOI requests

Your request was considered according to the principles set out in the National Assembly's Code of Practice on Public Access to Information (third edition). The Code is published on the Internet at www.information.wales.gov.uk.

If you are unhappy with the service you have received in relation to your request and wish to make a complaint or request a review of our decision, you should write to the Director of Collections and Research at the following address:

Mr John Williams-Davies
Director of Collections and Research
Amgueddfa Cymru – National Museum Wales
Cathays Park
Cardiff
CF10 3NP

When dealing with any concerns, we will follow the principles of the National Museum of Wales's Code of Practice on Complaints, which is available on our website at www.museumwales.ac.uk/en/45/.

Internal review requests should be submitted within two months of the date of receipt of the response to your original letter.

You also have the right to complain to the Information Commissioner's Office (ICO) if you are not content with the outcome of your complaint or review. Generally, the ICO will not make a decision unless you have exhausted the complaints procedure provided by the Museum.

The Information Commissioner can be contacted at:

Information Commissioner's Office – Wales
2nd Floor
Churchill House
Churchill Way
Cardiff
CF10 2HH

If you have any difficulties accessing the attached documents, please feel free to contact via my email address.

Yours sincerely,

Head of Knowledge & Information Management

Amgueddfa Cymru – National Museum Wales
Parc Cathays, Caerdydd CF10 3NP/Cathays Park, Cardiff CF10 3NP
Ffôn/Tel (029) 2039 7951 Ffacs/Fax (029) 2057 3321
E-bost: post@amgueddfacymru.ac.uk/E-mail: post@museumwales.ac.uk

8

Llywydd/President Eilsabeth Elias MA DL
Trysorydd/Treasurer J. Peter W. Morgan M.Sc FCS Cyfarwyddwr Cyffredinol/Director General David Anderson
Rhif elusen / Charity registration number: 525774
Rhif TAW / VAT registration number: GB 783 4541 10

national
museum
wales
amgueddfa
cymru



Appendix 1 – Scoring sheets

Catering Tender Interviews – Scoring Sheet Company..... *Kenny*

Tender interviews – individual focus	
Product offer; catering offer; corp catering offer; integrity of food chain – Nerys 20%	15%
Finance, capex, sales costs and profitability; partnership – Phil 20%	17%
Pricing, quality and value for family offer; St. Fagans; bilingual approach – Bethan 20%	15%
Customer service; employment; mgt and support structure; marketing – Mark 20%	18%
Inviting questions, overseeing and covering AOB points – Gareth 10%	5%
X factor - 10%	5%

75%

Catering Tender Interviews – Scoring Sheet Company.....*EOR*

Tender interviews – individual focus	
Product offer; catering offer; corp catering offer; integrity of food chain – Nerys 20%	12%
Finance, capex, sales costs and profitability; partnership – Phil 20%	17%
Pricing, quality and value for family offer; St. Fagans; bilingual approach – Bethan 20%	16%
Customer service; employment; mgt and support structure; marketing – Mark 20%	14%
Inviting questions, overseeing and covering AOB points – Gareth 10%	5%
X factor - 10%	5%

69%

Catering Tender Interviews – Scoring Sheet Company.....

Coh. Graz

Tender interviews – individual focus	
Product offer; catering offer; corp catering offer; integrity of food chain – Nerys 20%	16%
Finance, capex, sales costs and profitability; partnership – Phil 20%	10%
Pricing, quality and value for family offer; St. Fagans; bilingual approach – Bethan 20%	16%
Customer service; employment; mgt and support structure; marketing – Mark 20%	5%
Inviting questions, overseeing and covering AOB points – Gareth 10%	5%
X factor - 10%	5%

57%

Catering Tender Interviews – Scoring Sheet Company.....

Tender interviews – individual focus		Eg.
Product offer; catering offer; corp catering offer; integrity of food chain – Nerys 20%	<p>14</p> <p>15</p> <p>16</p> <p>17</p>	<p>14</p> <p>15</p> <p>16</p> <p>17</p>
Finance, capex, sales costs and profitability; partnership – Phil 20%	<p>18</p> <p>19</p>	<p>18</p> <p>19</p>
Pricing, quality and value for family offer; St. Fagans; bilingual approach – Bethan 20%	<p>20</p> <p>21</p>	<p>20</p> <p>21</p>
Customer service; employment; mgt and support structure; marketing – Mark 20%	<p>22</p> <p>23</p>	<p>22</p> <p>23</p>
Inviting questions, overseeing and covering AOB points – Gareth 10%	<p>24</p> <p>25</p>	<p>24</p> <p>25</p>
X factor - 10%	<p>26</p> <p>27</p>	<p>26</p> <p>27</p>

Good C.C. he an advisor?

Catering Tender Interviews – Scoring Sheet Company..... COULN CHART.....

Tender interviews – individual focus	
Product offer; catering offer; corp catering offer; integrity of food chain – Nerys 20%	<p>only 10% brand security 10% loverage good.</p>
Finance, capex, sales costs and profitability; partnership – Phil 20%	<p>CAPEX NOT IN PLACE NUMS STATES TOO HIGH 10%</p>
Pricing, quality and value for family offer; St. Fagans; bilingual approach – Bethan 20%	<p>17%</p>
Customer service; employment; mgt and support structure; marketing – Mark 20%	<p>10%.</p>
Inviting questions, overseeing and covering AOB points – Gareth 10%	<p>10%</p>
X factor - 10%	<p>Wolshens. 7%</p>

Catering Tender Interviews – Scoring Sheet Company..... **MUDS / clown**.....

Tender interviews – individual focus	
Product offer, catering offer; corp catering offer; integrity of food chain – Nerys 20%	Public 8% Corporate 8%
Finance, capex, sales costs and profitability; partnership – Phil 20%	Low capex for NMC + SF (no rakes) No room for negotiation Low rent compared to other bidders. Cautious / realistic sales. 15%
Pricing, quality and value for family offer; St. Fagans; bilingual approach – Bethan 20%	17% better bilingual.
Customer service; employment; mgt and support structure; marketing – Mark 20%	18%
Inviting questions, overseeing and covering AOB points – Gareth 10%	10%
X factor - 10%	Clear focused execution. 8% Weak finances.

People.
Lots of food.
Starts about 1-10 pm.

87%

Catering Tender Interviews - Scoring Sheet Company..... *Clear*

Tender interviews - individual focus	
Product offer; catering offer; corp catering offer; integrity of food chain - Nerys 20%	Public 7% } trend to head. Corporate 7%
Finance, capex, sales costs and profitability; partnership - Phil 20%	Good capex Over optimistic cost sales? Understand M.C.R. Strongest packaging Reduce cost by 60% to match vendors. Then Kudos to Colin Gray.
Pricing, quality and value for family offer; St. Fagans; bilingual approach - Bethan 20%	17%
Customer service; employment; mgt and support structure; marketing - Mark 20%	20%
Inviting questions, overseeing and covering AOB points - Gareth 10%	10%
X factor - 10%	Lots of ideas Not crashed Welsh Programme. 7% Consultant Chets wrong.

89%

5 people.
CEO M.D. Tim Marshall. Clear
Clear Ops Manager. ~~Mark~~ Mark
Nerys
Nethan - PR.

Catering Tender Interviews – Scoring Sheet Company..... *Ever* 74.....

Tender interviews – individual focus	
Product offer; catering offer; corp catering offer; integrity of food chain – Nerys 20%	14 Average response, dependant on broken flower.
Finance, capex, sales costs and profitability; partnership – Phil 20%	17 Over ambitious?
Pricing, quality and value for family offer; St. Fagans; bilingual approach – Bethan 20%	16
Customer service; employment; mgt and support structure; marketing – Mark 20%	17 Company infrastructure.
Inviting questions, overseeing and covering AOB points – Gareth 10%	5 Trying too hard.
X factor - 10%	5 Need too hard - over complicated.

Catering Tender Interviews - Scoring Sheet Company... *Bonni Gray Events & Catering* 6/4

Tender interviews - individual focus	
Product offer; catering offer; corp catering offer; integrity of food chain - Nerys 20%	Too much emphasis on Waterloo, Fine Taste - risk of losing Welsh Government support. 16
Finance, capex, sales costs and profitability; partnership - Phil 20%	Commitment to Castell Howell - wronging! 12
Pricing, quality and value for family offer; St. Fagans; bilingual approach - Bethan 20%	Good core offer. Evidence of being bilingual. 16
Customer service; employment; mgt and support structure; marketing - Mark 20%	Not sufficient infra structure. Bonni Gray would be severely stretched & under pressure to deliver. 12
Inviting questions, overseeing and covering AOB points - Gareth 10%	Fair - more emphasis on Marketing. Good answer to ethics. A
X factor - 10%	Good quality offering - hygienic. Tasty wash. 6.

Tender interviews – individual focus	
Product offer; catering offer; corp catering offer; integrity of food chain – Nerys 20%	18 Good product offer & understanding of some of the issues. Evidence of research.
Finance, capex, sales costs and profitability; partnership – Phil 20%	16 Enjoys & realistic turnover figures
Pricing, quality and value for family offer; St. Fagans; bilingual approach – Bethan 20%	17
Customer service; employment; mgt and support structure; marketing – Mark 20%	18 Strong infrastructure.
Inviting questions, overseeing and covering AOB points – Gareth 10%	8 Good response.
X factor - 10%	8 Innovation, creativity - food offering & style. Passionate.

John Cross → make primary business.

Team of five

Edward from Catell Hall.

Take a chance.

Local Welsh Company.

Track record in large events.

Relocate to St Fagan if development goes through.

Time Taste / Blue Brand.

Blue Deli

Value for money - steady.

Food hall level

Cowsey School.

Corporate Events - important.

Lunch party in each site

CG will have the local connection.

WG to licence

Blue Brand bus

Blue brand local in

Wales.

Marektein - Churches / Frankie + Benes.

Non-exec role.

Small business.

Run by owner/occupier

Castell Howell underwrite investment.

Nice high presentation.

Keep of spirit in Wales.

ethos

Passionate about Welsh food

+ delivering excellence every time.

Marketing contribution in addition. re TT / B/w
1000 per month. Marketing spend.

→ Licence agreement.

Query over length of time for audit
process for B/w TimeTaste.

Could lose Brand?

Expand to other sites - expand brand.

Sourcing - as much Welsh products as
possible.

Partnership with Clavell.

1984 est. / M.D. Farmer.

B/w's concept strong with customers / suppliers.

Will B/w only work with funding?

Carrell → M. Arts Centre?

Talked about E1000 / 110kms.

Priority issue.

Subscription price because Colin is buying more.

Further purchases for Welsh Campaign.

Do we just give them NAMS!

Elicir

Elicir food
supply
issues.

10 year business plan

refresh mid term

expanding current opportunities

address DB

109M

17M - G Mahony

50M - Marketing support

9M - Diners to drive business

3M - Charity fundraising

30M - St Angeles Councilhouse

1-4 STFS

1 NUMS + NMC

Workshops for families

Inhouse bakery - clash - no.

Supply other sites.

Food experts/producers

Too much about other stuff - not
enough about the food.

Patagonia Tea.

10 year plan with Andrew de Farm

Sponsorship deal for equipment

True Taste // where appropriate will be integrated

Caste Dining Room - Desirucha Restaurant

Party in courtyard. - Free offer

Awareness at that side of site.

Sales + Marketing Manager

External marketing

Private clients offer

Worked with DULA

WAGS benchmark

Andy Chye Start

MGB PR - relationship with Peter Meers

Create overarching brand for all tree sites

Procurement

Nostalgia

1998 Murray Weber but also UK

4 Days per month consultancy

Natasha -
also Free

Muor.

- Venue Negotiations - for venue hire.
- Call centre.
- No commission - spin off catering spend.
- Mince Gen Manager
Head Chef. at each site
- Responsible for Cost / Liquid bulking.
- 10 million retail sales - MD didn't know!
- Best Food + Beverage Supplier Winner.
- 65% of chefs nearest World Master chef
- Hotels - Swensen Weddings. low budget.
- Free marquee provided for
St Fagans. [Gross] Showing do we want to take
- Good kitchen. Food Innovation + keep to
- True Taste Sea Salt
- Fresh Farm. Veg
- Chem / Angela
- Planetary m. for. Meet the producer. All procurement driven.
- St Fagans - cake hot shop.
- Deli beef. → walking lunch.
- Delivers service for business.

Kudos

Charles Beer - Managing Partner ✓
Jon Pryce - MD ✓
Doreen Roe - Ops Director
Funding in Place - no recourse to finance
Security offer

Jessie Hooley - Central Teller
Maree - Sales Director - 10 years
Frank Bullen - Food Director

management & support →

- ① What other contracts do you run locally which can be used to support this contract if needed?
- ② Explain how you have considered your future requirements of this bid. Where have you taken over a contract in the past?
- ③ How many times have your company been in an employment tribunal in the last 5 years?
- ④ What activities and/or activities have you planned to support this contract?
- ⑤ We have asked that the local school to provide help to support our in-house café - exactly what do you have planned?

Q - Discounts for staff / Trustees / Patients / Friends?

Q - Costs charged for waste / utilities:

Q - nature of Cap Ex → agreed design but based on what we want?

Kudos Q - Presenting message?

⑥ How will you ensure that the quality of the service remains high? Customer feedback process → / Team Advice ⇒ How do you measure?
Myrtle Mopper Jence?

Bilipulam?

Not visited the site

Full time HTS, On-line reports.

Central Accounts, 3 times a year - Outreach of 300 clients.
Website Mktg team.

The perfect wedding company.
Dental + Health *

Middle - interested to gain experience.

lots about Gyrotonic here | Get about Joe Bloggs.

ST FAGARI - Team building (events) BBA / Blog Rowk?

Permit Marquee? - Share that (in a?)
Mtg Room based in a town.

Release Time Take.
Delivery Service?

Delivery redunt / Delt?

Farmer Market.
Family meal deal.

Deliver the 'extended' brand'

~~Elicor~~

Muleats + look per 1!

Angela Gray (not related?) how will we see these interact?

Mystay Nappe

Battery - long etc current fundire etc?

Pollinate about work load + delivery excellence questions?

Colin Gray ✓

Anthony Quilto - Event Production / design

Gereth Lloyd - Text ✓

Middle - low - level - Design + mktg.

Becky Dillmore

Edward Moran - Carlton Hotel.

Q Introduction - How many recent employees

✓

6

2 days

= 3

Q How will the majority money be spent? ✓

Q What experience do you have of TAFE - Size of Contract

Q what other venue do you operate of similar size

✓ Q Colin How much of you will be set when the contract is on.

Q who was responsible for (HFI) food hygiene.

Ref with Government ✓ x (5) major Pub point.

(7)

Colin Gray

Q Which brand will take balance B&W or an brand? →

Q If you don't get this contract were next for the company?

Q what is the £m cap ex? (Carlton Hotel?) ✓ Best maybe other.

Excellent Manager ex student (Dewison).

[Frankie + Beany] Chichibos.] Ruby Tuesdays

"over ride's"? Kich Vach.

110 Lines - Carlton Hotel.

[Length of licence of B&W - 4yr need to be reviewed.]

Appendix 2 – Letters to unsuccessful bidders

**Mr Colin Gray
Colin Gray Events & Catering
Unit 4a Swanbridge Court,
Bedwas Industrial Estate,
Caerphilly,
Mid Glamorgan,
CF83 8DW**

11th May 2012

Dear Mr Gray,

NMGW Enterprises Catering Tender 2012

Thank you for submitting a tender proposal in response to our invitation to tender for the catering operations at National Museum Cardiff, National History Museum St Fagans and National Waterfront Museum Swansea.

We have now completed our evaluation and inform you that unfortunately, on this occasion, your tender proposal has not been successful.

Whilst your tender proposal did well in respect of secondary criteria 1 & 6 and interview criteria 3 & 5 for the following reasons: bilingual experience, partnership proposal regarding appointment of a non-executive director to your board and welsh produce sourcing, it was not as strong in relation to your financial proposal (primary criteria), management resources (secondary criteria 2) and branding proposals (interview criteria 4) as the winning bid, which was submitted by Elior UK.

We will be seeking to finalise the contract with Elior UK based on their tender proposal as soon as possible but not before 28th May 2012.

If for any reason we are unable to finalise the contract with Elior UK for any reason then we may decide to proceed with the next highest scoring tender and we will advise you if this is the case

We appreciate that this will be a disappointing result for you and whilst there is no formal appeals process in respect of this tender process, we are happy to meet with you if you have any specific issues in connection with your tender proposal that you would like to discuss with us. If you feel that such a meeting would be helpful then please contact me: Mr Philip Smith C.E.O NMGW Enterprises Ltd, National Museum Cardiff, Cathays Park, Cardiff, CF10 3NP in writing with details of these issues and I will arrange a meeting at an appropriate time.

Thank you for your valued participation in this tender process.

Yours sincerely,

Mr Philip Smith

C.E.O. NMGW Enterprises Ltd

**Mr Jon Pryce
Kudos Catering UK Ltd
13 Bishopsgate,
London,
EC2N 3BA**

11th May 2012

Dear Mr Pryce,

NMGW Enterprises Catering Tender 2012

Thank you for submitting a tender proposal in response to our invitation to tender for the catering operations at National Museum Cardiff, National History Museum St Fagans and National Waterfront Museum Swansea.

We have now completed our evaluation and inform you that unfortunately, on this occasion, your tender proposal has not been successful.

Whilst your tender proposal did well in respect of interview criteria 1, 2 and 3 for the following reasons: ideas to develop both our public, corporate catering offers and sourcing of Welsh produce, it was not as strong in relation to your financial proposal (primary criteria), management resources/partnership working (secondary criteria 2&6) as the winning bid, which was submitted by Elior UK.

We will be seeking to finalise the contract with Elior UK based on their tender proposal as soon as possible but not before 28th May 2012.

If for any reason we are unable to finalise the contract with Elior UK for any reason then we may decide to proceed with the next highest scoring tender and we will advise you if this is the case.

We appreciate that this will be a disappointing result for you and whilst there is no formal appeals process in respect of this tender process, we are happy to meet with you if you have any specific issues in connection with your tender proposal that you would like to discuss with us. If you feel that such a meeting would be helpful then please contact me: Mr Philip Smith C.E.O NMGW Enterprises Ltd, National Museum Cardiff, Cathays Park, Cardiff, CF10 3NP in writing with details of these issues and I will arrange a meeting at an appropriate time.

Thank you for your valued participation in this tender process.

Yours sincerely,

Mr Philip Smith

C.E.O. NMGW Enterprises Ltd